Gender & women studies 2019

Papers

of the

Sixth International Conference on Gender & Women Studies 2019

held in

Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

on

17th & 18th of June 2019



2019 International Center for Research & Development Colombo, Sri Lanka

Gender & women studies 2019 (ISBN 978-955-4543-51-5)					
Published by					
International Center for Research & Development					
info@theicrd.org www.theicrd.org					

Published in Sri Lanka

ISBN978-955-4543-51-5

September 2019

Sixth International Conference on Gender & Women Studies 2019

Keynote Speakers

Dr. Kana Takamatsu

Associate Professor Politics and International Studies Department International Christian University, Tokyo, Japan

Dr Rafidah Hanim Mokhtar,

Associate Professor, Gender and Cardiovascular Physiology Researcher, Faculty of Medicine and Health Sciences Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia (USIM)

Conference Convener

Prabhath Patabendi (Head of International Center for Research & Development)

Organizer

International Center for Research & Development (ICRD)

Conference Partner

Unique Conferences Canada

International Scientific Committee

Prof. Dr. N.S. Cooray (Japan)

Dr. Cristeta Dulos (Philippines)

Dr Helen Peterson (Sweden)

Prof. Cher Weixia Chen (USA)

Prof. Risa Morimoto (United Kingdom)

Dr (Mrs.) Upena D Dalal (India)

Dr Rafidah Hanim Mokhtar (Malaysia)

Dr. Rajesh K. Chander (India)

Dr. Grace V. S. Chin (Malaysia)

Prof. Patricia de Pablos (Spain)

Prof. Tennyson Samraj (Canada)

Dr. Timothy F. Yerima (Nigeria)

Prof. Donathan Brown (USA)

Dr. Anuradha Benerjee (India)

International Center for Research & Development

DISCLAIMER:

All views expressed in these proceedings are those of the authors AND THERRFORE THE AUTHORS HOLD RESPONSIBLE FOR THE VIEWS CONTAINED IN THIS PUBLICATION and THE PUBLISHERS do not necessarily represent the views of, and should not be attributed to, the International Center for Research & Development and Unique Conferences Canada.

The publishers do not warrant that the information in this publication is free from errors or omissions.

The publishers do not accept any form of liability, be it contractual, tortuous, or otherwise, for the contents of this publication for any consequences arising from its use or any reliance place on it.

The information, opinions and advice contained in this publication may not relate to, be relevant to, a reader's particular interest.

Portions of this publication are copyrighted. Except as permitted under the Copyright Act, the copyrighted parts may not be copied or reproduced by any process, electronic or otherwise, without the specific written permission of the copyright owners. Neither may information be stored electronically in any form whatsoever without such permission.

International Center for Research & Development

Email: info@theicrd.org

Website: http://www.theicrd.org

Table of Contents

	Topics of the Abstracts	Presenting Authors	Page No.
1	Politic of Identity, Between Conflict and Compromise to Construct the Social Identity: The Case Study Toward the Wearing of Hijabs by the Christian Woman Students on Serve as Paskibraka in Halmahera Selatan	Dr. Flavius Floris Andries, MA	6
2	Bodies and Seeing in Karen Duve's Novel This Is Not a Love Song	Dr. Sayaka Oki	13
3	Violence against Women in Northern Nigeria: An Islamic Rules on Domestic Abuse.	Dr. Aishatu Abubakar Kumo	18
4	Women Inventors of the turn of the 19th to the 20th century	Dr. Maria Helena Teixeira da Silva	26
5	Determinants of Violence against women and girls within the communities in Nigeria	Dr. Akanle Florence Foluso	33
6	A Study of the State of Women-Centric Films in Bollywood	Kabbyashree Dasgupta	42
7	Retrieving and (Re-reading) My Teenage Online Diaries: A Space for Cultivating and Becoming Girl's Sexuality	Mattanyu Meksawat	49
8	The impact of the women's inclusion in peace negotiations	Fahimeh M Kashkooli	55
9	Physical Violence Against Women in Uganda: The experience of 30 female prisoners convicted of murder	Kiconco Milliam	62
10	Comprehending and critiquing the concept of 'honour' in contemporary Muslim communities.	Sanah Mehnaz	70
11	Women and access to family planning: Women's right to decide: A distant reality in India	Ms Nanki Singh	76
12	Justice After the Violence: An Assessment of Peruvian Legal Protections for Victims of Domestic Violence	Elim Shanko	82

Politic of Identity, between Conflict and Compromise to Construct the Social Identity: The Case study toward the Wearing of Hijabs by the Christian Woman Students while Serving as Paskibraka in Halmahera Selatan

Flavius Floris Andries, MA

Lecturer of Religion and social culture at The Christian Religious education Department of the Christian State Institution of Ambon (Indonesia)

Abstract

The existence of identity, individually or collectively, often causes conflict in our society. It is indicating that the current policy and regulation seems to be unfair. In this situation, a minority identity is weak and often becomes victim. It is good to study the phenomenon from identity politics point of view: between resistance and compromise identity in public. The issue raises two critical questions: 1. Why does the government policy treat civil rights unfairly? 2) How does the impact of the Policy for the minority rights? To answer, a qualitative research is conducted by collecting data, observation, interview and literature study. The data are analyzed using cultural study approach. The result shows that hijab-wearing for a Christian female student policy means the State gave unfair treatment towards the minority. It had a correlation with local politic dynamic. The policy split people in two debate sides: conflict and compromise. Conflict concerns religious identity awareness being discriminated and social identity meaning body, power, and femininity. Compromise deals with the minority survival strategy under the domination of patriarchy.

Key words: Nation, Hijab, Conflict and Compromise Women Identity

Introduction

Identity is essential for every individual or community because it relates to the human capacity to know who they are. Jenkins (2008:8) says that identity is human capacity to recognize himself and others. This definition includes another people's capability to recognize us and themselves. This view reaffirms the opinion that identity is a social product which closely relates to social relationship and social construction around us. Identity emerges because of the interaction between individuals in the society. From this interaction process emerge awareness that identity is to distinguish and to equalize between one person and the other. The Interaction of every individual with identity label effects on receiving or refusing, conflict and violence. These conflict or violence could happen because of identity labels such as religion, ethnic, gender, women and children. Therefore, identity issue may become a phenomenon.

The identity phenomenon such as conflict and violence connecting to Religion, race, ethnic as an identity is phenomenal because of conflict, violence in the name of religion, race, and ethnic, gender and women colors human dynamic. Identity harassment occurs everywhere such as Hindu-Islam conflict in India (Varshney, 2003). In Indonesia, particularly, within two decades, religion and ethnic identities from many different elements have triggered conflict and fight (Mas'oed, 2000; Betrand, 2004; Mujiburahman, 2006). Various kinds of conflicts recorded indicate that variety identities as multicultural reality has to be managed seriously. From the new Order to reformation Order, the variety identities have always been unfinished problems for violence especially between Islam and Christian frequently happened (Liddle, 1996:323-356; Husein, 2001; Silivan, 2001:11-131; Azra, 2000), or oppression toward certain identity (gender and women) has become socio-cultural empirical reality in Indonesia. The previous research conducted by Nurul Ikasari was about women issue. Nurul's research focused on the oppression and ethnic discrimination toward women. Through her analysis on a film entitled "Sapu Tangan Fang Yin", she describes the existence of Chinese in Indonesia since the colonial era until the reform era that shows not only in the form of stereotype (China Benteng) but also in the form of oppression (rape) toward Chinese women as happened in the 1998 incidence (Laksari: 63). This phenomenon shows that not only ethnic identity but also women identity is a problem.

Discrimination and oppression toward women in Indonesia also happened in South Halmahera when the local government insisted the Christian students to wear Hijabs when they were on duty as a flag raiser team. The other discrimination for Christian female describe by the local government policy

insisted Christian pupils from Elementary to Senior High who are obliged to be in sharia atmosphere in non-Islam schools make Halmahera sociologically different from other regions because they must dress like Muslims such as wearing long skirts and long sleeve clothes. Focus on Hijab for Christian female student has serving as a flag raiser in a ceremony in 2015 received protests. Nevertheless, the practice continued until 2018, event female student protest, but the coaches, who were from National Army, argued hijab was only accessory of the uniform (personal interview, August 2018). This phenomenon confirms that the government policy is partial, even disrespects the rights of the minority as a civil society. Basically, it is a multiculturalism problem that can be split into several questions, among others are:

- Why does the government policy treat civil rights unfairly?
- How does the impact of the Policy for minority rights?

This qualitative study collects data through interview, observation, and literature study. Data are analyzed under cultural study based on critical approach that makes intellectual reflection towards political dynamic, culture, and history. Political, cultural, and historical matters are related with construction. Therefore, cultural study works to understand ways to get results, distribute them, and produce them. The cultural study approach should be used in awareness that individual and collective identities are always constructed and are flexible. It makes the writer to view the ideology behind any matter related with the conflict and compromise in South Halmahera especially hijab as accessory for Paskibraka as part of habitus.

Data interpretation is a process of explaining and analyzing data confidently collected from a construction so it will give new results in meaning. Analysis is first done to the uneven policy implemented to civil rights and responses from both Muslim and non-Muslim.

Religion and Politics in Consideration of the Government Policies That Are Not Neutral toward The Minority Rights

Politics in Indonesia after the new order has changed from representation to participation, and every person is free to determine his own political choice. The political contestation become much more competitive and this situation provides chances for every political actor to get involved in transactional politics between the actor and the political party or between the actor and the constituents. Democratic system from cultural representation to de-liberalization politics makes political parties to affiliate to ideology from nationalist to ethnicities and religious. The shift also brings so-called identity politics. In South Halmahera or Bacan and the surrounding in particular, this type of politics directly intersects with ethnic identity that is religion. The phenomenon occurs in any context. An informant with initial N said:

"The religion-based ratio of population in Halmahera District is 65% to 30%. With that ratio, of the 30 members in the legislative were being competed in the PILKADA, 5 to 10 of it should be of Christians. But, in fact, only two members are Christians. It shows that voters of both religions put ethnicity forward" (personal interview, August 2018).

The statement confirms that identity politics in the context of de-liberalization politic is actually attached in ethnic identity and not in religion. It implies that a candidate from a hard-line religion-based party will always receive enough votes as he is of the same ethnic.

The informant N said that tribe primordial is the primary concern. Here ethnicity dominates over quality in any election. Sociological bound of Tobelo-Galela is not only lip service, but a practical matter in political communication. Tobelo-Galela has been a dominant culture in South Halmahera (personal Interview, August 2018). These two acts have been a habitus of the people of South Halmahera during political momentum and have been a Doxa for the politic community from both religions (cf. Bourdieu, 1977:169). Doxa makes the minority put religion and its less-in-number aside when voting. An interviewee said:

"Politic of ethnic identity made a political actor Mr. Kasubah won in two successive PILKADA in South Halmahera although PKS, a religion not nationalist-based

party, carried him on. The same case happened in the late PILKADA where the winner was the nephew of the former" (personal Interview, August 2018).

The statement indicates that doxa has been used to influence over society habitus in particular the minority (Christian) to put religion and its less-in-number aside. Doxa has been internalized so that Tobelo-Galela be part of their life. After the electoral political process, the government policies have not considered the aspect of multi-ethnics in Tobelo-Galela, and Islam has been consideration in political decision. Take an example of a statement of a PKS politician as the rulling party in South Halmahera. He said:

"Religion becomes the basis of political consideration that must be parallel with the rulling party's vision and ideology. This religious vision is an effort to apply the Rahmatan lil alamin concept in every political decision and community service. This religious concept is formulated in three important jargons: clean, care and professional" (personal Interview, August 2018).

The 'care' aspect of the PKS jargon is interesting to be discussed in relation with the multicultural fact of the socio-culture. This multicultural sensitivity does not appear on the PKS political decision as showed by the regent leadership. An interview with the participant of National Democrat Party said that:

"The local government decisions always support the majority's interest (Islam), for example the office and school uniforms for women both Muslims and Christian must be in line with Islamic norms, moreover Christian students who joined the flag raiser team must wear hijab (veil)" (personal Interview, August, 2018).

The participant's information indicates that the government decision from PKS showed intolerance toward the minorities. These minorities have been forced to receive Islamic norms in terms of the way to dress up. One of the participants from National Democratic party said that this thing happened because of the implication of PKS vision and mission as the party with exclusive religious ideology.

The above information reaffirms that PKS is the rolling party with an exclusive religion ideology. Its implication appeared clearly on the government policies which are intolerant toward minorities. The imposing of 'melting pot' policy which is shown by the school and office uniforms that should be in line with Islamic norms is an example.

The Impact of Hijab in Paskibraka Moment to Minority Rights

Conflict and Compromise

Paskibraka team was quarantined and practiced marching, flag raising and downing for a month before they were in action. During that time, they were not informed about hijab-wearing policy. Learning from the previous year, a female Christian asked the matter to the coach. An interview with some informants who once were members gives various answers. Informant with initial V said:

"As I passed the selection, I had the question for I knew that a female Christian had to wear a hijab in the previous year. My coach said he would suggest four female Christians would not have to wear hijab. On the night of inauguration, we did not wear hijab, and it made us happy. The next morning, however, at dawn, we just knew that we, the four Christians, had to wear hijab. Our coach said that it was the Bupati's order, but I refused to put it on" (personal Interview, August 2018).

While informant with initial E explained:

"From the beginning nobody told us that there was a hijab-wearing policy on the 17^{th} August Ceremony day. It was only on the night of inauguration that we knew, and we were shocked. Besides, we refused to put it on. We argued that we were Christians. Why should we put a hijab on? Besides, our parents would be mad" (personal Interview, August 2018).

It can be seen that something sensitive and related to identity symbol is hidden from the candidates. Hijab-wearing refusal is one kind of conflict. Liliwery (2005:249) said that conflict was a natural disagreement caused by individual or group difference in standpoint, believe, value and need. Fisher (2000:4) also stated conflict is a relationship between two or more parties (individual or groups) who have or think they have incompatible goals. Both Liliwery and Fisher emphasize incompatible interest between two subjects, individual or group. Hijab-wearing enforcement underlay the conflict. It agrees to Fisher's argument (2000:8) in his theory of conflict and says that in identity theory perspective a conflict emerges as individual or group's identity is threatened.

Confrontation is a way to maintain one's identity because of identity awareness of who he is individually and collectively. The informant's refusal and parents' involvement show that they know pretty well their position individually and collectively. It also shows that they are not only representation of individual but also collective. This is Richard Jenkins (2008:18) meant. Identity is human's ability to recognize who he is and who others are. Referring to Jenkins' concept on identity, hijab-wearing refusal by the informants is a form of identity awareness on both problem and community basis. Knowledge related to identity instruments has become habitus that embodied with the informants.

Identity conflict occurred in the hijab-wearing phenomenon involved not only the committee and the doers – the female Christians of the paskibraka – but also parents of the doers and religion institution. An interview with one of parents of 2015 paskibraka member revealed:

"On the night of inauguration, the committee asked us to allow our children to wear accessories the following day. We simply thought that the accessories meant were make-up and the like, so we let them. The next morning at around 5, I was shocked to hear on the phone my daughter crying. She said on the phone she wanted to quit from the team for she had to wear hijab. I was raged as I heard. I fully understand that hijab is Muslim fashion but why did my daughter, who was a Christian, have to wear it. I disagreed and telephoned a pastor. She suggested my daughter follow the rule for the sake of national moment. Besides, wearing hijab did not mean losing Christianity identity" (personal Interview, August 2018).

Parents and clergyman's involvement are a kind of identity negotiation although the female Christian put the hijab, an accessory to the coach's opinion, on at last. It was nationalism the Christian clergyman put forward that made the conflict ended. Identity negotiation ended with compromise under nationalism ideology. On one hand the statement of national moment is the keywords by the clergyman to solve the conflict of identity was happened, but on the other hand the clergymen also contradict with the term of identity and also cultural identities in particular. For Lawler in the narrative of identities, it was embedded in relation and they challenged to the idea of the atomized individual because individual always incorporate with others (Lawler: 2008: 30). The women Christian student try to ignore wearing the hijab is an effort to show the strengthening of self-identity but is weak. As an individual, who is facing with the state power that has been represented by the military as the coach in relation subject and object or domination and dominated.

The statement of Clergymen about nationalism in this case is correlated to the Benedict Anderson statement is imagined communities. The statement of nationalism as imagine community interpreted by Johann Gottfried Herder as bourgeois ideology (Heywood, 2002:109. There is no educated values such as tolerance to human rights as appreciation to multicultural fact in South of Halmahera context according to Taylor demonstrated namely cultural recognition (Taylor 1994). The wearing the hijabs by Christian student on serve as paskibraka in the ritual of Independence days to show the discrimination to the civil individual rights as religious communities and other minorities rights. The implementation spirit of nationalism in Bacan South Halmahera where political interest influences policy-taking that against the minority. Current leaders do not look the nationalism spirit of their predecessor who put their belief aside for the sake of national unity under Pancasila and Constitution of 1945. In this context, nationalism acts like glue to maintain the existence of the nation. Exclusivism and fanaticism that dominate public policy threat integrity of the nation. Nationalism characteristic by faith and high tolerance to identity fades. Identity awareness fades when a symbolic power oppresses certain group identity which leads to losing critical faculty due to uniformity idea. The unawareness of the meaning of identity symbol appears where hijab is identical to Islam. In the Islam ideology, hijab is not an accessory, but an ideology intended to cover female Muslim's body that is already a sharia.

Another reason of compromised identity through hijab is as said by the following informant:

"Actually, as parent, I disagree if my daughter must wear hijab when she is on the serve. The only reasonable consideration is that she wants to be a police officer and I do not want her to have any problems with the test later on, so I follow what the committee wants" (personal Interview, August 2018).

The statement implicitly describes the reality of the community in Bacan, South Halmahera that religion phenomenon becomes one consideration when dealing with administrative and practice things. The minority is always in a weak position and has no choice but adjusting himself with the interest of the majority.

Power, Body and Femininity

Beside religion identity appearing in the hijab-wearing phenomenon, minority problem also concerns with feminism. The female Christian who wore hijab on the serve is a representation of a girl whose rights to choose what is good, appropriate, and allowed is abandoned. Her rights of identity as a decision maker is restricted by the nation for the sake of interest. The phenomenon is a picture of a woman whose rights is stuck. It happens beyond the habitus of the body with putting on symbol and has to obey the rhythm and pattern of the game in the arena. It is seen here the symbolic abuse towards women where the power represented by the coach's order put his trainees object of power he is doing (cf. Bourdieu, 1995:23,164). These trainees are aware and refuse to wear hijab. The refusal they do does not merely relate to religion but also to their faith as women who are usually cornered by the system. It is clearly stated by the following informant:

"Knowing that I had to put on hijab, I was deeply disappointed not only for religion reason. I was so unhappy that I had to have my long hair cut short and covered with hijab" (personal Interview, August 2018).

One of rituals, female Paskibraka is to have short hair. The above informant implies that cutting hair short means nothing when it has to be covered with hijab. Here a body functions a ritual practice performativity that is always unified with knowledge, outlook, and experience of a woman.

It is seen how power was used to oppress the minority and the Christian student involved in the Paskibraka team was a victim in symbolic violence to the minority in religion and gender. The woman's body is becoming something that performativity of body can no longer represent a free self (Butler, 1993:95). Wearing a hijab while serving in Paskibraka in South Halmahera, the female Christian was not a free subject but a prepared one. Butler (1993:95) confirms:

"Performativity is neither free play nor theatrical self-presentation, nor can it be simply equated with performance. Moreover, constraint is not necessarily that which sets a limit to performativity, constraint is rather, that which implies and sustains performativity."

Butler explains the difference between performance and performativity where performance does not occur freely. This is what happened to the female Christian in the Paskibraka team in South Halmahera, so performativity appearing in her body was not an identity representation or the real habitus, as Bourdieu said, or identity subjectivity, but a form of imitation caused by interest. Butler in Sarah Fenstermaker and Candace West (2002:11) mentioned that gender, subjectivity and identity... are constitute in and performativity produced (and reproduced) through discourse. Discourse is getting more dominant in producing identity, subjectivity even gender performatively. The dominant discourse in Halmahera context is uniformity discourse. In other words, hijab is the representation of uniformity form of girls in service of Paskibraka. Therefore, both Islam and Christian girls must take it. It is clear that subjectivity (even femininity) is a product full of power domination that unconsciously performs symbolic abuse.

The picture of practice of power and symbolic abuse is getting stronger through uniformity speech act represented in hijab-wearing for every girl, Muslim and Christian, in service of Paskibraka. It is the social environment that makes an embryo to emerge uniformity discourse and act as Searle (in Carlson, 2004:63) called it illocutionary act and perlocutionary act, an arena dominantly influenced by dominant culture (sharia). It influences the form of woman subjectivity. Butler (1993:232) said:

"There is a girl "However, is compelled to 'cite" the norm in order to qualify and remain a viable subject femininity is thus not the product of a choice, but the forcible citation of a norm, one whose complex historicity is in dissociable from relation if discipline, regulation punishment. Indeed, there is no "one" who takes on a gender norm. On the contrary, this citation of the gender norms is necessary in order to qualify as a "one" to become viable as a "one" where subject formation is dependent on the prior operation of legitimating gender norms."

In her social life, a girl has to pick up norm to be accepted and to be the subject that may be available. Norm of uniformity is particular in nature but then is forced to be shared norm. This is Bourdieu called 'Doxa' (Bourdieu, 1977:169). The picture of a female Christian is wearing hijab on her service in Paskibraka is a form of speech act or doxa that shows a subject – object relationship. The female Christian is the representation of the minority from many different angles whose rights is dominated through doxa, in this case an imperative language to maintain moral values and symbol of hijab as moral representation.

Therefore, femininity is not the result of a decision, but rather of grabbing forcefully of norm that is complicated historically and is not separated from discipline, law. This is what happened to female Christian students in South Halmahera while in service in Paskibraka. Wearing hijab was not her personal choice, which is free, but the outsiders made her do, among them is a social situation behind her consideration. Referring to Butler's opinion, a female in service of Paskibraka in South Halmahera is officially accepted when she obeys and does accordingly.

Conclusion

The study shows that identity is phenomenal thing and is always debatable. In this context, the state has an essential role and even takes part in the debate from religion, ethnic, and other identity point of view. From the available data, it is discovered that the nation and community in general habitus in South Halmahera always put minority identity in terms of religion and social like women in subordinate position.

Local politics context with de-liberalization politics system is one of the reasons of the matter. The one man one vote system makes the nation represented in apparatus, bupati and his staff, as well as legislative seem to be helpless, even fail to show its existence. The minority groups both in religion and in social (women) always receive unfairness by the state because of colonizing-sense and restraining-sense system. The system affects the policy that is unfair to civil rights.

Conflict is a representation of identity awareness against doxa ended with compromise as a form of helplessness of the minority in terms of religion, gender, and social. The consciousness of self-existence as dignified human beings with intrinsic rights appears in the form of conflict. Though it ended with negotiation leading to compromise based on doxa, the compromise is the representation of the minority group's helplessness in public space. Woman care movement being present to advocate and fight for woman rights is a social engineering although it has not touched the phenomenon of hijab-wearing for Christian female in serve of Paskibraka. In other word, the scope of the struggle focuses on physical points, putting aside violence symbolic aspect caused by structural and politics arena dominated by the majority in religion and social.

Reference

- Azra Azumardy, 2000, The International Confrence on Religion and Culture in Asia Pasific: Violence or Healing, RMIT, Melbourne, 22-25 Oktober 2000.
- Betrand, Jacques, 2004, Nationalism and Ethnic Conflict in Indonesia, Cambridge University Press, USA
- Bourdieu Pierre, 1995, Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste, Cambridge, Harvard University Press
- Bourdieu Pierre, (977) Outline Of A Theory of Practice, USA, Cambridge University press.
- Butler, Judith, 1993, Bodies That Matter, New York and London: Routledge.
- Budianta Melani, 2004, Multiculturalism: In Search of a Critical Framework for Assesing Diversity in Indonesia, in Indonesia, Anthropology Journal, 2004.
- Carlson, Marvin, 2004, Performance: a Critical Introduction: New York, Routledge.
- Fisher Simon, 2000, Working with Conflict: Skill and Strategies for Action, Zed Book, London
- Ikasari Prinisia Nurul, 2017, Saputangan Fang Yin, Jurnal Komunikasi dan Media, Vol.1.No.1, Oktober.
- Jenkins Richard, 2008, Social Identity, London and New York, Routledge...
- Lawler Stephen, 2008, Identity: Sociological Perspective, Polity Press Cambridge, UK
- Maso'ed Mohtar, 2000, Kekerasan Kolektif, Kondisi dan Pemicu, Yogyakarta, P3PUGM.
- Mujiburrahman, 2006, Feeling Threatened Muslim-Christian Relations Indonesia's New Order, ISIM Dissertation, Amsterdam University Press.
- Sweetman Brendan, 2006, Why Politics Needs Religion, Illinois, Intervarsity Press.
- Taylor, Charles, 1994, Multiculturalism: Examining the Politics of Recognition, Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Fenstermaker Sarah and Candace West (eds) 2002 Doing Gender, Doing Difference Inequality, Power and Institutional Change, New York and London, Routledge.
- William, Liddle. R, 1996, Media Dakwah Scripturalism: One from of Islamic Political Thought and in New Order Indonesia, Temple, Arizona State University.